NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF PUBLIC SERVICE DOCTORAL SCHOOL OF LAW ENFORCEMENT

József BEKE

The formation and development of counter-terrorism in Hungary during the Cold War in the light of the "C-79" file

AUTHOR'S SUMMARY OF THE DOCTORAL (PHD) DISSERTATION

Consultant:

Professor Dr. József BODA ret. major general

BUDAPEST, 2023

Actuality and justification of the choice of topic

The actuality of the dissertation is that if we observe the social processes that are still taking place in the present day, which can fundamentally change the structure, composition, and thinking of a society, which influence political processes both individually and as a whole (e.g., migration processes), and compare it with the examined era with other political processes, we experience many similarities. I am thinking primarily of the fact that the political and social events and changes that began or are already in full swing at the height of the Cold War (student revolts, the strengthening of left-wing movements, the independence of colonies or aspirations for independence, local wars such as the Arab-Israeli one, etc.) have generated such level of security changes, as a result of which new policing tasks and special police units, which did not exist before, were formed, with a special task, with methods and tactical procedures not previously known or used in law enforcement. If we are able to recognize these social and criminological processes in time, interpret them correctly, and react proactively to them, then we will not be "cluttering" after the events, but we will even be able to prevent harmful processes. If we stick to the migration mentioned in our example, we can see that in several (Western) European countries there are a significant number of minorities (with a migration background), whose religious and cultural background is significantly different from that of the majority (European) society. In the future, it is imperative to recognize this as a source of increasing social, political, and public security tensions. If we do not foresee or recognize harmful processes in time, we will have to face not only the phenomenon of terrorism, but also the possibility of potentially larger-scale violent demonstrations or riots. In addition, we must point out that the specialists of the Hungarian Defense Forces, the Hungarian Police, and the Counter-Terrorism Center perform their duties in mission areas, i.e., in locations where the threat of terrorism exists as a real threat.

Formulation of the scientific problem

After the regime change, several daily newspapers published the news that Carlos, the notorious terrorist, had spent years in Hungary with the assistance of the Hungarian State Security Agencies. Balázs Horváth, then Minister of the Interior, and Lajos Nagy, the first Director General of the National Security Office created after the regime change, launched an internal investigation

to determine how and to what extent the State Security Services were involved in the fact that Carlos and his group were hiding in Budapest and were preparing for several terrorist acts here, among others, for the attack on Radio Free Europe in Munich. During the internal investigation, the appointed prosecutors were able to study the entire C-79 file. At the end of the investigation, the prosecutors clearly established that, based on the documents provided to them, no charges could be brought against anyone for helping the members of Carlos and his terrorist group.

According to the semi-official explanation of the then MDF (Magyar Demokrata Fórum) government, the full disclosure of the Carlos case would have significantly increased Hungary's terrorist threat. Namely, because during this period Carlos was still the largest terrorist in Europe. Some researchers and historians rather assumed that the government preferred not to reveal that some of the officials who might have helped Carlos were still in office. In any case, the documents regularly handed over by the domestic authorities to the STASI, their partner body in the GDR (East Germany), are also available to historians and law enforcement researchers, so the events can actually be partly reconstructed.

During my research, I looked for an answer to what level of cooperation there was between the Hungarian authorities and foreign terrorist organizations. The most well-known terrorist organization and terrorist, who operated and lived in Budapest for a long time between 1979 and 1986, was Carlos and his organization called "The Arab Armed Struggle Organization – The Arm of the Arab Revolution". Through the history and operation of the "Jackal" – as most people know it – and its terrorist organization in Hungary, I would like to find out and answer whether the terrorists could "enjoy" their stay here with a tolerated or supported status. Furthermore, how did their stay in our country influence the formation and development of domestic counter-terrorism? How did the emergence of terrorist organizations affect the formation and development of institutionalized Hungarian counter-terrorism? In the dissertation, I divide the development history of counter-terrorism into two parts. On the one hand, I will present the counter-terrorist unit created by the state security services, which was responsible for "intelligence" and prevention tasks related to terrorism at the time. I also present the history and development of the special service branch of the Hungarian police, which was primarily responsible for the execution of counter-terrorism tasks.

I have structured the dissertation in such a way that I manage to convey a few thoughts or important information about every significant circumstance on the subject. In the theoretical part, I lay down theoretical foundations related to the conceptual problem of terrorism and the theory of counter-terrorism. In addition to all this, an essential part of the topic is the review of the history of domestic criminal law regulation of terrorism. I will also briefly present the era from both a world political and domestic point of view. I will analyze the history and development of state security organizations in order to better understand why the decisions made by the decision-makers regarding terrorist organizations, especially the Carlos group, were made. I will also present in detail the Carlos group, its best-known assassinations, and the circumstances of its stay in Hungary. Last but not least, I will analyze the development history of the special service branch of the Hungarian police. Placing the formation and development of the Hungarian Special Police Service in an international context, we can conclude that the initial circumstance was a significant criminal behavior that had not been experienced before.

Hypotheses

- 1.) Based on social and political processes and changes, the appearance or disappearance of certain criminal phenomena in a given society can be predicted. It follows that the domestic and international social and political conditions of the Cold War had a significant impact on the foundation and operation of Hungarian counter-terrorism.
- 2.) Before the system change, the Hungarian law enforcement and police force typically played a reactive and not a proactive role in the field of counter-terrorism.
- 3.) Based on the practical experience of the period before the regime change, it would have been possible to initiate criminal proceedings against the Kádár government and the political and law enforcement leaders of the era for supporting international terrorism.

Research objectives

- My generally defined goal is to analyze and present the new challenges that the social and political processes that took place in the world and in Hungary before the regime change presented to Hungarian law enforcement, which led to the development of institutionalized counter-terrorism.
- At the beginning of my research, I studied the limited literature available on the subject. Based on my source analyses, I set myself the goal of conducting a qualitative, systematizing research, which, by reviewing the history of Hungarian counter-terrorism, reveals the formation, operation and development of this special branch of law enforcement.
- My personal goal is that my research and its results can provide a professional basis for the creation of educational aids presenting and processing the history of Hungarian counterterrorism, with the cooperation of the departments of National University of Public Service, which can be used by law enforcement, national security and military professionals of the future, including counter-terrorism officers.
- Another personal goal of mine is to combine and synthesize the theoretical knowledge I have acquired in my field of research and the practical knowledge I have developed over the years I have spent in the field. I want to make my research results, the development of counterterrorism and the history of its development available and familiar to today's law enforcement, national security and military professionals in the form of professional publications.

Research methodology

Given the topic I was researching, I used qualitative methods in parallel with each other during my research:

 Elaboration of domestic and foreign literature on the topic - primarily in English and German due to my language skills. In this context, I examined the domestic and foreign political connections that led to the development of institutionalized counter-terrorism in Hungary. During the study and processing of the relevant literature, I divided the entire research topic into theoretical and practical parts using analysis and synthesis. I connected the partial knowledge obtained with the help of this into a single part.

- I conducted research in the Historical Archives of the State Security Services, where, in addition to the daily operational reports, I also studied orders and instructions that were relevant to my topic and declassified. I checked all the relevant documents related to the establishment of Counter-Terrorism Department and its task system. I have studied all operational reports, summary reports or management briefings that are related to the activities of the "Carlos Group" in Hungary and that can currently be researched.
- I did research in the Hungarian National Archives. The state security services continuously informed the leaders of the party and the political decision-makers about the priority cases. The C-79 file has not been decrypted to this day, however, due to the obligation to provide information, the results of the observations and analyzes were sent to the communist party headquarters. Thanks to this, I had the opportunity to study all documents related to the activities of the "Carlos group" or other terrorist organizations (Abu Nidal, Japanese Red Army) in Hungary, their network of contacts or the circumstances of their surveillance. Due to the topic, this typically falls on the period from 1975 to 1989. In the Archives, I also had the opportunity to study the circumstances and development of the Hungarian police's ability to eradicate terrorism through the documents that can be researched there, including through the Balassagyarmat hostage case.
- I conducted research in the Berlin STASI archive at the BStU. During the preparation of my research, I learned that the Hungarian state security agencies sent some of the information generated during the processing of the "Carlos group" to the East German and Polish state security organizations. After the fall of the Berlin Wall, the German authorities practically made the STASI files searchable in their entirety. I studied the thousands of pages of the file under the code name "SEPARAT" at the BStU. I found interesting Hungarian aspects in this, which I will present in detail later in my thesis. However, I must also mention that the German

authorities did not make the entire file searchable in its entirety either. The encryption of documents that would clearly prove the close cooperation and possible support of the East German (and other Eastern European, except Romanian) secret services and the terrorist organization led by Carlos has still not been declassified.

- I also conducted research in the archives of the Polish National Remembrance Committee, in which the Embassy of Hungary in Warsaw was of great help. Although the Poles did not make the entire state security material searchable, some of the documents created during the processing of the "Carlos group", mainly the information and materials received from Hungarian partner organizations about 350 pages can be explored. These data primarily relate to the structure of the Carlos group and its relationship system, and is available on the website of the Hamvas Institute. Apart from these, I did not find any new data or documents.
- One of the most important elements of my research method is "Oral History". I had the opportunity to interview with the former head of the Counter-Terrorist Department, Dr. József Varga, and with the still-living colleagues, who had insight into the Carlos case. Unfortunately, several people canceled the meeting before the interview, citing that a significant part of the case is still classified, and they do not want to commit a breach of confidentiality, even carelessly. I was also able to interview László Liszkai, who wrote several books and filmed several documentaries about the Jackal, and for this reason visited him in prison at least fifty times. I managed to conduct an interview with the retired police lieutenant colonel János B., who served for nearly thirty years as a group commander and trainer in the action platoons, the Action Sub-Department and the Komondor Counter-Terrorist Service about the formation and development of the special counter-terrorism operations of the Hungarian police. In the course of my research, I wanted to conduct an interview with the "Jackal", however, the French internal affairs attaché accredited to Hungary, the employee of the DGSI, did not respond to my request. Through László Liszkai, Carlos indicated that he was willing to answer some of my written questions. Mr. Liszkai took the questions and the "Jackal" answers to and from the prison when he visited him at the end of August 2021.

Last but not least, I also conducted research in the archives of Hungarian Television (MTVA). Between 1990 and 1994, the programs "Panoráma" and "Hét" edited by Alajos Chrudinák, several programs edited by the already mentioned László Liszkai dealt with Sakál's activities in Hungary. During the reports, they interrogated the then leaders of the state security services, former members of foreign security services and foreign experts on the subject. On top of that, the staff of the Hungarian State Security Agencies in Budapest also presented details of a covert interrogation of Carlos.

Scientific classification of the research area

Within the social sciences, my research area can be classified in the discipline of law enforcement. However, my research topic is interdisciplinary, as it is organically connected to other disciplines in several areas, primarily history, military science, criminology, and political and legal sciences. Therefore, my thesis proves that multidisciplinary law enforcement has now become a transdisciplinary (integration) science. Policing as an integrative science examines police activity as a whole in the complexity of individual scientific solution proposals.

A related scientific field is the science of history, since the dissertation presents the history of the development and development of a special branch of law enforcement. In addition, it also places the topic of the research in a historical context by presenting in detail the Cold War as a historical era and political system, without which the political and professional decisions made in the Carlos case, would be difficult to interpret. On the other hand, the formation, transformation, and development of (terrorist) organizations becomes understandable through the historical context. Thirdly, the science of history is also one of the tools to present the evolutionary process of terrorism so that we can understand it better.

A very important related field of science is military science. Terrorism can be fought by law enforcement as well as by military means and methods, which in some cases is necessary. These tools and methods are not far from each other in certain cases, especially during armed counter-terrorism operation.

Another important scientific field is criminology, with the help of which I would like to clarify the conceptual problems of terrorism and its separation from organized crime. With the help of this branch of science, it is also possible to present the secret information gathering tools and methods, which the Hungarian State Security Service used against the Carlos group during their reconnaissance and prevention work.

Last, but certainly not least, the science of state and law are also a very important field of study. Based on the basic principle of criminal law "nullum crimen sine lege nulla poena sine lege" formulated in Roman law, an act can only be sanctioned if it is ordered to be punished by law. Accordingly, in the dissertation, I would like to analyze the emergence and changes of the "terrorist act" and other related legal facts in the Hungarian criminal law system, primarily from the Csemegi Penal Code to the present day.

Brief summary of the research per chapter

In the first chapter, I clarified some important basic concepts of law enforcement, which are relevant from the point of view of the dissertation. The definition of terrorism is particularly significant, but its formulation is still at the center of professional debates today. The reason for this is, on the one hand, the different interpretation and evaluation of the criminal phenomenon. During the historical overview of terrorism, I used the eras in which there is currently a consensus. I analyzed the new left wave separately, considering that it determined the ideological background of the Carlos group's operation. It is very important, one of the central elements of the thesis, that in the first chapter, according to my own ideas and professional experience, I created and presented a somewhat general, logical-functional counter-terrorism model, according to my own ideas and professional experience, regarding the special, complex activities of the counter-terrorism services. Considering the topic of the doctoral dissertation, the model I set up is complemented by the counter-terrorist tasks of the police, more specifically; it is most specialized element, the countering of terrorist acts. From the point of view of the topic of the dissertation, my task was to examine in the first chapter how the Hungarian criminal law and its development and changes related to terrorism and related crimes during the Cold War. In terms of criminal law, we can exclusively classify a crime as a terrorist act from the moment it appears in Hungarian criminal

law. Due to the prohibition of retroactive effect, there is no legal possibility to classify a previously committed act as a terrorist attack or terrorism.

In the second chapter, I presented the history of the development of the Hungarian State Security Services, as well as the changes in their responsibilities and organizational system in the period between 1945 and 1990. Considering the fact that before 1978, there was no institutionalized counter-terrorism within the framework of state security in our country, in the predecessor organizations only the detection and prevention of delicts related to terrorism could be part of their competence. One such type of crime was sabotage, which was often referred to in common language and politics as a synonym for terrorism - incorrectly. In the course of my research, I established and presented in the chapter that Hungary has never been among the states most threatened by terrorism throughout its history. In order to support this statement, I compared the number of terrorist acts committed in the world, in Western Europe, Eastern Europe and in our country between 1970 and 1990. Although I found only one case in the database used during the examined period, this does not mean that terrorists or all forms of terrorism have so far avoided us. In this chapter, I went through and analyzed some events or cases that are not included in the database, but which occurred in Hungary or against Hungarian interests before the regime change, and which could be connected to the act of terrorism or crimes related to terrorism. In my opinion, these cases could have had an impact on the decisions and decision-makers that led to the development of independent Hungarian counter-terrorism, or contributed significantly to the development of the counter-terrorism field and the acquisition of the necessary professional experience.

In the third chapter, I showed that, based on the available data, the Hungarian Counter-Terrorist Agencies considered Carlos a terrorist. It can also be shown that he and his organization also confirmed the creation and development of the first counter-terrorist unit in connection with the control of its domestic activities, whose first real case was actually the C-79 dossier. Although we could see that Carlos and his organization were not the only terrorist and terror group that turned up in our country, they are undoubtedly the most significant. The importance and impact of the organization on the formation and development of Hungarian counter-terrorism was further enhanced by the fact that, according to the data obtained during the research, Hungarian specialists

were able to learn the tricks of the trade through it. In fact, everyone in the group was a trained counter-terrorist officer in their own field, but until processing the Jackal, they had no experience of how an international terrorist organization works. This complex prevention work could only be successful in the framework of international cooperation. In support of this, in the chapter I presented the possibilities of the international cooperation of the state security service, its legal background, as well as its practical implementation in relation to STASI. During the research and data collection, I explored the professional background of the surveillance of terrorists and the processing of the C-79 file, with special regard to the secret information gathering tools, methods, and procedures used and used during the operative work. In this context, Hungarian counterterrorists were able to obtain accurate information about the terrorists' domestic and international contact system, the background of their operations, the terrorist acts they planned, their equipment and weapons, etc. Based on the data presented in this chapter, in my opinion, the Hungarian State Security Agencies did everything possible and deployed the entire range of operational tools and methods at their disposal in order to bring the Jackal and his organization under the closest possible surveillance. At the same time, they mapped and restricted their activities and relations in Hungary, and forced them out of the country.

In the fourth chapter, I showed that in Hungary, after the 1973 Balassagyarmat hostage-taking case, special police units, trained and equipped to deal with situations related to terrorism, the action platoons, were created within the Revolutionary Police Regiment. In the chapter, I presented all the essential circumstances of the aforementioned hostage situation and its impact on the establishment of the Hungarian Special Police Service. I analyzed the history, organizational structure, personnel relations, task and training system of the domestic special police units, from the action platoons up to and including the Komondor Counter-Terrorist Service. Of course, the presentation of the Police Bomb Squad, the analysis of its task system and organizational background could not be left out of the analysis. In the chapter, I presented the four jobs that exist within the special law enforcement service for three of which I created the concepts of liquidator, special counter-terrorism dog handler, and technical liquidator.

Summary conclusions

By writing this dissertation, my fundamental and definite goal was to analyze and demonstrate how the social and political processes that took place in the world and in Hungary prior to the regime change presented the Hungarian police with new challenges, which eventually led to the development of institutionalized counter-terrorism.

From the processes presented and analyzed in the thesis, it is clear and can be deduced that the institutionalized counter-terrorism (reconnaissance, intelligence gathering, prevention) practically simultaneously with the appearance of the Carlos group, while the counter-terrorism service branch was created as a consequence of the Balassagyarmat hostage situation in the Hungarian law enforcement. This could also mean that, until the 1970s, law enforcement professionals did not attach more importance to modern terrorism, or, having misjudged international trends, they believed that the phenomenon would avoid our country. This is contradicted by the fact that even before the appearance of the special service branches, there were attacks against Hungarian interests in our country and abroad, which could have been legally classified as acts of terrorism. However, it is also a fact that, until 1979, the Hungarian legal system was not prepared to prosecute the act of terrorism in an independent legal situation. The presented actions could only be sanctioned for ancillary crimes (e.g., misuse of firearms, violation of personal freedom, etc.) that were punishable by the laws in force in the examined era. Although the international examples clearly showed (and I also supported this with statistics extracted from the GTD databases) that the number of terrorist acts in Western Europe showed a clear increase starting from the second half of the 1970s. However, it is also true that, on the other hand, this number stagnated in Eastern Europe and only started to rise sharply around the time of the regime changes, at the end of the 1980s. As I mentioned, these effects did not affect the branches of Hungarian counter-terrorism at the same time.

In the past, former socialist countries – including Hungary - were accused of having terrorists stay in their territory with the knowledge and consent of the political leadership at the time, and of providing support (material, logistical, training, etc.) to their terrorist acts, primarily in Western Europe. According to the accusations, they received not only logistical background,

material and technical support, but also specific "orders". This raises the charge of financing terrorism. Members of the Carlos group have been tried, indicted and convicted several times. However, the politicians who gave orders to the Jackal and the organization connected to it to carry out terrorist acts, assassinations, murders, and political showdowns were not even questioned as witnesses in the case. However, without these assignments (and the active support of the secret services they control), the Carlos group, or even modern terrorism, could not have caused such great damage in material terms - and in human lives either. Most countries - except for Germany - have not yet declassified documents related to it, although I have shown that Germany has only done so to a very limited extent. However, from these files and documents, it could be clearly seen which dictator, government, or Secret Service commissioned which assassination. The results of my research show that the victims of the bombing attack against the Romanian transmitter of Radio Free Europe in Munich actually died because of an Eastern European Secret Service, on its behalf.

As I have mentioned several times, the C-79 file is unfortunately still not accessible. It is certainly in the archives of the Office for the Protection of the Constitution, still waiting for the secret keeper to decrypt and allow access. My hypothesis number three will only be clearly decided if the materials become researchable in their entirety. Based on the available reports in the State Security Archives, the files studied at the BStU, the testimonies of retired operational officers Dr. József Varga and Miklós Szabó, and the interviews conducted with those still alive, it cannot be clearly stated that there was no cooperation between the Hungarian State and the Carlos group. In the course of the thesis, I also concluded that in order to put the Jackal and his organization under the closest possible surveillance, map their activities and connections in Hungary, limit them, and expel them from the country, the Hungarian State Security Agencies did everything possible by deploying the entire range of operative tools and methods. In addition, they had to achieve and choose the selected operative goals and tactics in such a way that Carlos and his team did not take revenge on Hungarian interests in Hungary or abroad, which was a realistic possibility anyway.

In my opinion, the unit successfully solved the tasks assigned to it. This is proven by the fact that the investigating judge Jean-Louis Bruguière, who directed the French investigation against Carlos, did not in any case convict or make accusations against our country for supporting a terrorist organization during the criminal proceedings and court hearings. In conclusion, I can

state that during my research, I was unable to prove that the Hungarian State Security Agencies, specifically, the staff of the Department III of the Ministry of Internal Affairs did not cooperate with Carlos's organization, or that neither them nor the Hungarian Government could have been accused of supporting terrorism. It is true that the opposite cannot be said either.

New scientific results

- 1.) As a result of my systematic research, I managed to uncover the history, formation, and development of Hungarian counter-terrorism, and put it in context with the appearance and operation of the Carlos group in Hungary, one of the most well-known and decisive terrorist organizations of the era. During my research, I was the first to process and systematize the state security and police professional materials related to Carlos's terrorist organization. Regarding his relations with foreign secret services, I further expanded the systematization, analysis, and evaluation by conducting professional personal interviews.
- 2.) By analyzing domestic and foreign professional materials, I explored and presented the history of the formation, development, and evolution of the special service branch of the Hungarian police. I placed particular emphasis on the operation, development, and presentation of the development of the Komondor Counter-Terrorist Service from the action platoons. In relation to the field of expertise, I have defined basic concepts that have not been formulated yet in an exact way in the special service branch of the police (liquidator, technical liquidator, special counter-terrorism dog handler).
- 3.) As a result of my extensive research, I formulated and developed a kind of logical-functional theoretical model of counter-terrorism, which I presented in detail in my dissertation. According to the theoretical system I set up and presented in this chapter, the sociopolitical environment and the goals to be achieved determine whether we can talk about defensive or offensive means and methods of counter-terrorism. The elaborated model also involved the presentation of these tools, methods, and tactical procedures at all three presented practical levels of counter-terrorism.

Recommendations, the practical usability of the research work

My research and its results can be used in the BSc, MSc courses of the National University of Public Service, as well as in the doctoral school of law enforcement and military science, law enforcement, counter-terrorism, military national security, and civilian national security. In addition, professionals working in the field of national security, law enforcement, military, and counter-terrorism can use the theoretical and practical experiences revealed in the thesis in their daily work.

Specific applicability of the results of the thesis:

- 1.) In my opinion, the scientific research I carried out for the preparation of the thesis and its results can provide a sufficient professional basis for the creation of teaching aids presenting and processing the history of Hungarian counter-terrorism, with the cooperation of the Department of Counter-Terrorism of the National University of Public Service, which will be prepared by future law enforcement professionals, including counter-terrorism may be used by its officers. Given that I used to work in this field myself, it is an important element of general professional education to learn about the formation and development history of this special field.
- 2.) With my dissertation, I can draw the attention of professional decision-makers to the fact that the classification of C-79 will be re-examined, so that the reports and observation results can be researched as much as possible, based on which we can get an even clearer picture of Carlos and his terrorist organization in Hungary or related to Hungary about his activities. As we have seen, we already know a lot (I have researched many things myself), but the whole truth is still hidden in the classified C-79 file.

The author's list of publications related to the topic

1. József BEKE - Dr. Gabriella HEGYES: The beginnings of counter-terrorism in Hungary - File C-79, (T)error&Elhárítás, 2015/1.

- 2. József BEKE: Deliberate leak or inexplicable professional error? Péter Győző Varga's announcement. Journal of Prosecutors, 4/2021.
- 3. József BEKE: The establishment of the East German Ministry of State Security and its cooperation with the Hungarian state security services 1945-1990, National Security Review, Volume 7, Issue 4, 2019.
- 4. József BEKE: The creation of the special service branch of the Hungarian police, the history of its development and operation 1973-1990), Policing Science Actualities, conference volume, 2020
- 5. József BEKE: Attack on the Hungarian Embassy in Bern. August 16, 1958, In the Service of the Country Conference volume, 2021.
- 6. József BEKE: Types of terrorism, its conceptual problems, Police-Science-Actualities Conference volume, 2019.
- 7. József BEKE: The impact of the Balassagyarmat hostage-taking incident on the establishment of the special service branch of the Hungarian police. Criminal Law Review, 2021/2.
- 8. Beke József: The system and forms of cooperation between the Hungarian and East German state security services in the Carlos case. Belügyi Szemle/Nemzetközi Rendészeti Figyelő 72. évfolyam 1. Különszám, 2023.
- 9. BEKE József: The general model of counter-terrorism (A terrorelhárítás általános modellje) Scientia et Securitas, Volume 4, Issue 1, 2023.