

**National Defence University Zrínyi Miklós  
Faculty of Military Science Kossuth Lajos  
PhD School of Military Sciences**

Noémi MINTÁL

**The multilateral non-proliferation export-control regimes in the beginning of the 21st  
century**

Summary of PhD thesis

Director of studies:  
Lt. Col. Tibor BABOS, PhD

2011

*„One of our most urgent priorities must be attacking the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction (...) If we do not stem the proliferation of the world's deadliest weapons, no democracy can feel secure.”*  
Les ASPIN

### **The summary of the problem**

The multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes create an important component of the international community, because their participating states cooperate against the proliferation of weapons of mass destruction. Most of the states which own weapons of mass destruction bought the needed components through trade channels. Therefore export control is an essential element in slowing down the proliferation and the limiting technologies linked to the weapons of mass destruction and weaponry: it can make the weapons of mass destruction much more expensive – financially as well as diplomatically. If the states cannot intensify their export control and adapt to the globalised world, wider trade, high technologies, and the possibilities given by the Internet, then the efficiency of multilateral control will decline, and the terror danger will grow.

The thesis of this doctoral dissertation is that non-proliferation trade control has a definitive impact on the international peace and security; therefore it needs significant attention and cooperation from the states. In other words, trade control becomes an increasingly complex task because of the rash development of the globalised economy, trade relations, and technology – already uncontrollable – hence without the cooperation and harmonisation of control policies with the states of the international community, trade control is almost impossible.

This dissertation makes a concrete proposal that the current non-proliferation export control regimes should integrate in order to establish a super regime with formal arrangement including the most important supplier states, rationalising and simplifying the working mechanism of the current regimes, so that the foreign trade of sensitive goods and technologies can be controlled uniformly and efficiently.

### **The aims of the research**

The main goals of this dissertation are: to study the working mechanisms of the non-proliferation regimes within the system of international relations, to reveal their shortcomings, and with corrective actions and academic demands, to make a proposal for establishing a consideration system which intensifies the control opportunities and the effectiveness of the

regimes. The proposal is that the export control regimes function with common aims and similar instruments, but rationalise in different institutions, establishing in the field of non-proliferation a simpler and more effective export control system. As this issue does not always get the adequate attention from the international and Hungarian policymakers, my aim is to reveal their functioning and problems, and with that contribute to the familiarization of this thesis.

### **Methodology**

In the course of working out this thesis I used general methodology: analysis, synthesis, induction, analogies, historical methods, comparisons, and tendencies, with specific examination of military science.

In the interest of achieving the main goals I studied and analysed basic documents of international arrangements, international law, and aquis communitaire related to the project. I processed and analysed relevant Hungarian and foreign publications, results of other specialists. I also interviewed domestic and foreign civil servants to analyse and compare their viewpoints. I searched the Internet for information, studies, analysis, and dissertations of the project, deduced the conclusions, and made proposals for solution.

### **The structure of the dissertation**

This dissertation goes from general to specific; accordingly, it clarifies the basic definitions first and then provides an overview about globalized, European, and Hungarian systems.

Expounding on the issues below the dissertation provides a solution to the emphasized problem and proves the thesis.

This doctoral dissertation is divided into six chapters:

- 1) The basis of the multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes;
- 2) Challenges of the globalized world in the field of non-proliferation export control;
- 3) The non-proliferation regime of the European Union;
- 4) The problems of the multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes;
- 5) The future of the multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes: the actuality and possibility of establishing of a super regime;
- 6) Summary.

The constant change in international politics draws more and more attention to the stopping of the illegal movement of weapons of mass destruction and their means of delivery,

and to the obstruction of trade control alleviation. In order to reach this aim, some countries have established non-proliferation export control regimes. Chapter one analyses the role of the multilateral export control regimes in non-proliferation and appreciates the importance of export control in international relations towards creating international peace and security. This chapter emphasizes the historical need, development, international legal background, importance, and the common elements of multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes. The thesis of this chapter is that export control is not homogeneous and the scrutiny of each part is really important to understand. Every common feature and difference is analyzed, which characterizes every regime, or just a couple of them.

Chapter two ratiocinates that in the time of globalisation such as the beginning of the 21st century, trade control has an increased role in stopping the spread of goods which threaten non-proliferation. This brings forth an increased need of sticking together. The control of threatening goods and technologies and goods which can be used for both military and civilian purposes has evolved into an enormous challenge due to the speeding up of the technological development. This chapter points out the challenges of our globalized world equipped with high-tech goods, and suggests additional contributions of nations, because only their governments can stop the illegal trade.

Chapter three analyzes the non-proliferation challenges and problems of the European Union. Nations dominated by the integration of friendly industrial interests have to reconsider their efforts made in the past, and must have a common opinion in the field of non-proliferation. According to this, the EU is one of the international organisations which take on the most significant responsibility in this area: trying to react to the changes of the world, and having close cooperation with its exporter companies. The dilemma is with the purpose of reducing obstacles from the channels of trade and the rule of supervising, characterizing the connection of the EU member states and the globalised world. The European Security Strategy has made it clear that the organisation has to pay attention to the dangers of non-proliferation. This is why EU has an aim to overtake, deter, stop, or eliminate the proliferation programs which concern us. One issue with the analysis is that the community export control regime in the field of dual use items was established to conserve international peace. Chapter three also analyses the current export licensing procedure in Hungary.

Chapter four analyses the internal and external incompleteness, characterizing the regimes, based on their capability of working and efficiency. The origin of this problem on the one hand is a complex historical heritage and dynamic environment, on the other hand it is the wrong political and functional decisions.

Chapter five shows that in the future there is a need and actuality of transforming the currently functioning multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes into a so called super regime in order to make common, efficient efforts. A suggestion is made to investigate the following circumstances in order to harmonize them: the informal nature of regimes, questions of membership and decision making, lack of information sharing, problems of political attention and sources, understanding and adopting principles to the practice of supervising in the field, problems of an informal approval rejecting secondary proliferation, and the significance of American pressure and industry in the procedure of controlling. Defining the new challenges that the analysed regimes have to face, due to the security risks globalisation and deciding whether they can be handled by a super regime are important questions. Finally the chapter analyzes and values the attitude of the political leaders of member states in connection with this change.

Chapter six summarizes the results of the doctoral dissertation and determines that there is an opportunity to intensify trade control in the field of non-proliferation among the nations. Establishing a super regime is considered to be the most effective solution by the dissertation; nevertheless, it is against the political, industrial, security and trading interest of many nations.

### **Conclusions**

In summary, with the demonstration of the significance of the multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes, I focused the attention to one and perhaps the most effective form of non-proliferation of weapons of mass destruction: the importance of trade control. After the presentation and analysis of the shortcomings of the functioning regimes, I made a proposal to establish a new super regime, which can solve the problems of the current regimes. I emphasized that in an age of terrorists and their supporters seeking dangerous technologies and weapons, the economic interest of suppliers ought not to be more important than the security interests of the nations.

I hope that the above mentioned suggestions will appear in the current debate about the comprehensive reform of non-proliferation regimes and help to place the essential idea of reformation of export control into the agenda. Innovation was the earmark of the multilateral export control regimes, and it may be so again.

## **Academic contributions**

With the research of the multilateral non-proliferation export control regimes I reached the following academic contributions:

1. I discovered that in consequence of different participating states and diverse fields of responsibility persistent problems of competence, cumulative counter-interests and unregulated fields arise.
2. I certified that due to technological development, liberalising international relations, growing economical competition, and mostly the fear of the misuse of weapons of mass destruction the danger has been increased and it is unavoidable to have a comprehensive approach and complex reregulation of the current non-proliferation export control regimes.
3. I confirmed that in the interest of the preservation of peace and security, multilateral cooperation in the field of non-proliferation export control is essential; therefore, according to the multilateral norms, interstate cooperation should be further intensified.
4. I worked out the basis of an alternative global non-proliferation export control super regime – in which the current regimes join with their participating states and emerge as a global, integrated, formal super regime so that the trade of goods and technology can be controlled uniformly and effectively.

## **Recommendation for practical usage**

In case of acceptance of these academic contributions, I suggest that educational and research institutions dealing with foreign and security policy and international studies should use this dissertation for their work.

This dissertation – because of its complexity – can help in both the education and graduate training of specialists and policymakers working in this field of security policy.

The thesis – through its interdisciplinary character – also deserves the attention of the general audience that follows the national and international security, economic and trade policies, and academic and technological efforts in the field of proliferation of weapons of mass destruction. Consequently, I suggest that this dissertation should be accessible on the Internet as an open source.

Because non-proliferation export control of weapons of mass destruction still has a lot of open questions and scientifically unexamined fields, I suggest the whole dissertation and the parts of it, discussed in the different chapters, be given attention by future researchers.

The thesis of this dissertation and the actuality and possibility of the establishing a super regime detailed in chapter five should be subject of consideration by Hungarian authorities and policymakers. After positive academic, professional and governmental decisions, the competent domestic authorities could analyse the conditions and possibilities of establishing a super regime and perhaps the lead nation role could be undertaken by Hungary.

### **Publications**

- Dec. 2010 Arms trade and international security in the globalised world; in *Hadtudományi Szemle*; Year 2010 Issue 4; pp. 30-38.
- March 2010 Opportunities of the establishing of a super regime in the field of non-proliferation, in *Nemzet és Biztonság*; Volume 3 Issue 2; pp. 20-28.
- October 2008 Export control of dual-use items during the cold war and in Hungary today; in *AARMS*; Year 2008, Volume 7 Issue 3; pp. 397-406.
- October 2008 The export control of arms and dual use items; in *Nemzet és Biztonság*; Volume 1 Issue 2; pp. 59-66.
- 2007 The international relations of the European neutral states; in *Társadalom és Honvédelem*; Volume 11 Issue 2; pp. 167-183.
- Aug. 2007 The European Union and the non-proliferation; in *Új Honvédségi Szemle*; Volume 16 Issue 8; pp. 10-18.
- Dec. 2006 Hungary and the concept of neutrality; National Defence University Zrínyi Miklós; Central Library; Manuscript KV 517
- May 2006 Debates about the military capabilities of the European Union; in *Új Honvédségi Szemle*; Volume 15 Issue 5; pp. 52-63.
- 2005 Military capabilities of the European Union: debate and reality; 27<sup>th</sup> National Academic Student Conference
- 2004 Organisational side of the European defence – the army; in *Parlamentari ösztöndíjasok 2003/2004*; pp. 212-234.

## Curriculum vitae

Name: **Noémi Mintál**  
Date of birth: 19 September 1980  
Place of birth: Kiskunhalas  
Address: 8000 Székesfehérvár, Lövölde u. 17/C 5. em. 3.  
Mobile phone: +3670/ 33-95-909  
E-mail address: [mintalnoemi@yahoo.com](mailto:mintalnoemi@yahoo.com)

### **Workplace:**

June 2010 Defence policy advisor  
Secretariat of Administrative State Secretary  
Ministry of Defence

### **Previous workplaces:**

2008-2010 Deputy Central Point of Contact for European Defence Agency and specialist  
in EU military capability development  
Strategic Analysis and Planning Unit  
Defence Policy Department  
Ministry of Defence

2008-2009 Mandatory teacher  
Social Science Department  
Kodolányi János College

2005-2008 specialist in EU cooperation and export-import licensing  
Department for Arms Trade and Export Control  
Hungarian Trade Licensing Office

### **Education:**

2005-2008 National Defence University Zrínyi Miklós, Ph.D training,  
thesis: Multilateral export control regimes in early 21<sup>st</sup> century

2003-2006 Budapest Business School, College of Management and Business Studies,  
Economy-diplomacy and International Management Subject, Budapest,  
economist

2000-2005 National Defence University Zrínyi Miklós, Faculty of Military Sciences  
Kossuth Lajos, Security and Defence policy Subject, expert in security and  
defence policy



### **Language skills:**

2005	Advanced level – English (specialised in economy)
2002	Intermediate level – Italian (specialised in military)
2000	Advanced level – German
2000	Deutsches Sprachdiplom II. (language exam of Germany)

### **IT skills:**

2007	European Computer Driving Licence
------	-----------------------------------

### **Postgraduate courses:**

2010	George C. Marshall Centre, Seminar on Transatlantic Civil Security, Garmisch-Partenkirchen, Germany, one week
2009	Arms Control, NATO School, Oberammergau, Germany, one week
2008	George C. Marshall Centre, Seminar on Transatlantic Civil Security, Garmisch-Partenkirchen, Germany, four weeks
2008	National Public Administration Professional Exam
2003-2005	Studies on the European Union at Budapest Business School, College of Management and Business Studies
2003	Budapest Corvinus University, „Theory and practice of international politics” by Dr. Kiss J. László, and „Politics and Economic Policies” by Dávid Tamás

### **Academic activities:**

2006-2007	visitor teacher: Multinational non-proliferation regimes and the practice of the EU, National Defence University Zrínyi Miklós International and Security Studies Department
2005-2006	member of the Hungarian Economic Association
From 2004	member of the Alumni for Europe

### **Prizes, scholarships:**

2010	“For National Defence” Merit Cross 3 <sup>rd</sup> Class
2005	27 <sup>th</sup> National Academic Student Conference, Military Sciences Section, 1 <sup>st</sup> place: Military capabilities of the European Union: debate and reality
2005	27 <sup>th</sup> National Academic Student Conference, Military Sciences Section, two special prizes

- 2003-2005 Scholarship of European Administration Training
- 2003-2004 Scholarship in the Office of the Hungarian Parliament

**Speeches in English:**

- 2008-2010 European Defence Agency, Preparatory Committee for defence ministers steering board
- 2006-2008 Dual Use Working Group of the EU

**Experiences:**

- 2005 Ministry for Home Affairs, Department for NATO-EU Coordination – seven weeks
- 2004 Local Government of Budapest Capital, Mayor's Office, Office of European Integration and Foreign Affairs - one week
- 2004 Office of the General Assembly of County Bács-Kiskun, Defence General Office – one month
- 2004 Office of the General Assembly of County Bács-Kiskun, Organisation and European Integration Department – one month
- 2004 Office of the Prime Minister, Governmental Strategic Analysing Centre, Analysing and Planning Major Department – two weeks
- 2003-2004 Office of the Hungarian Parliament, Defence Committee, junior clerk
- 2003 National Defence University Zrínyi Miklós, Department of Security and Strategic Studies, demonstrator – two weeks

*„The end of the scientific research is always,  
that there are suddenly more problems there  
where earlier there was only one.“*

Norman MAILER